SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

REPORT TO: Development and Conservation Control Committee 6th July 2005

AUTHOR/S: Director of Development Services

S/0897/05/F - Great Shelford Dwelling rear of 13 Cabbage Moor for Mrs B Carpenter

Recommendation: Approval Date for determination: 1st July 2005

Site and Proposal

- 1. The application site measures 30m x 17m (0.05 hectares/0.13 acres) excluding the access and currently forms part of the rear garden of No.13 Cabbage Moor, a part 1½, part 2½ storey painted brick and pantile house. The proposed access runs parallel to the existing track serving Nos. 15 and 17 Cabbage Moor. A camping and caravan site is situated to the north of the site, No.17 (a chalet dwelling with sitting room and playroom patio doors at ground floor level and a high level first floor window in the gable facing the site, and a sitting out area between the dwelling and the site) is located to the east, No.13 is to the south and the rear garden of No.11 is situated to the west of the main part of the site.
- 2. This full application, registered on the 6th May 2005, proposes the erection of a 3-bedroom plus games room chalet dwelling measuring 2.2m to eaves and 6.8m to ridge. It would be faced with bricks and weatherboarding and would have photovoltaic tiles and solar panels on the roof. The plans indicate that the attached single garage/porch element closest to No.17 would have a 'living roof'. The density (excluding the access) equates to 20 dwellings to the hectare.

Planning History

- 3. Permission for an extension to No.13 was granted in 1991 under reference **S/1785/91/F**.
- 4. Outline planning permission for a bungalow on the site was refused but subsequently granted on appeal in 1997 under reference **S/1589/96/O**. Permission was renewed in 2000 and again in 2003 under references **S/1619/00/O** and **S/1877/03/O** respectively.
- 5. A full application for a dwelling on the site of very similar design to the dwelling now proposed, albeit that the main part of the dwelling was closer to No.17 than now proposed, was refused in January 2005 under reference **S/2318/04/F** for the following reason:

"By virtue of its size, height and proximity to the existing dwelling, and sitting out area on the western side of the dwelling, at No.17 Cabbage Moor, the proposed dwelling would be unduly overbearing when viewed from, and would seriously harm the outlook from and light to, the windows in the west elevation of No.17 Cabbage Moor and the sitting out area on the western side of that dwelling.

The proposal is therefore contrary to South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004 Policies SE2, which requires residential development in the village to be sensitive to the

amenities of neighbours, and HG11, which states that development to the rear of existing properties will only be permitted where the development would not result in overbearing or overshadowing of existing residential properties."

Planning Policy

- 6. Structure Plan 2003 **Policy P1/3** requires a high standard of design for all new development which responds to the local character of the built environment.
- 7. Local Plan 2004 **Policy SE2** states that residential development will be permitted on unallocated land within Great Shelford provided that (a) the retention of the site in its present form is not essential to the character of the village; (b) the development would be sensitive to the character of the village, local features of landscape or ecological importance, and the amenities of neighbours; (c) the village has the necessary infrastructure capacity; and (d) residential development would not conflict with another policy of the Plan, particularly policy EM8 which relates to the loss of employment sites. It also states that development should provide an appropriate mix of dwellings in terms of size, type and affordability and should achieve a minimum density of 30 dwellings to the hectare unless there are strong design grounds for not doing so.
- 8. Local Plan 2004 **Policy HG10** states that residential developments will be required to make the best use of the site and that the design and layout of schemes should be informed by the wider character and context of the local townscape and landscape. Schemes should also achieve high quality design and distinctiveness, avoiding inflexible standards and promoting energy efficiency.

Consultation

- 9. **Great Shelford Parish Council** recommends refusal stating "This dwelling is almost identical to that submitted in November 2004 which was refused. As the Inspector stated the building should be single storey and this is a 2 storey dwelling we recommend refusal."
- 10. **Chief Environmental Health Officer** recommends conditions and informatives relating to power operated machinery during the period of construction, driven pile foundations and bonfires/burning of waste during construction are attached to any permission.
- 11. At the time of application S/2318/04/F, the **Trees & Landscape Officer** stated that, in view of the approval for the extension at No.17, he must concede that it would be difficult to specify a reason for refusal in relation to the proximity of the adjacent young broadleaf trees.

Representations

- 12. The occupiers of Nos. 11 and 13 Cabbage Moor object on the following grounds:
 - The scheme is nearly identical in size, height, storey and dimension to the previously refused application;
 - Outline permission was granted for a bungalow whereas the submitted plans are for an ill-thought out, completely inappropriate, intrusive, substantial house on an already small cramped site;
 - Overlooking and loss of privacy, light to, views from and overbearing to No.17:

- Noise and disturbance to occupiers of No.17 resulting from use of the access and garage port;
- Devaluation of No.17;
- An additional increase in the size of the access could make the area very dangerous.
- Loss of bushes, shrubbery and planting;
- Proposal does not meet requirements of the Village Design Statement; and
- Drainage.

Planning Comments - Key Issues

- 13. The main issues in relation to this application are the impacts of the development on:
 - The character and appearance of the area; and
 - The amenity of neighbours, and the occupiers of No.17 in particular.
- 14. The principle of erecting a dwelling on the site with access off Cabbage Moor in the position proposed has previously been established at appeal and by subsequent approvals, albeit that approval was only sought for a bungalow at the time of those applications. Regrettably, an access in this position would result in the removal of established trees.
- 15. A dwelling with accommodation in the roofspace is now proposed. Dwellings in the locality are of varying storey heights and designs and the design of the dwelling and its impact on the character of the area are considered to be acceptable.
- 16. Subject to compliance with the recommended conditions, there would be no serious overlooking of neighbouring properties. It would also be important to ensure that a bound finish was used for the driveway and parking/manoeuvring areas to minimise noise disturbance to adjoining residents.
- 17. The proposal would still have an impact on the outlook from, and light to, the windows in the west elevation of No.17 Cabbage Moor and the sitting out area on the western side of that dwelling. There would be a gap of 7m between the proposed house and the west elevation of No. 17, increasing to 12m from the higher 1½ storey element of the proposed house. However, by easing the main body of the dwelling a further 2.5-3m away from the boundary with No.17 than the refused scheme, I consider that this proposal would, just about, ensure that the amenities of the occupiers of No.17 would not be seriously affected. The proposal would not unduly affect the amenity of neighbours in any other respect.

Recommendation

18. Approval

- 1. Standard Condition A Time limited permission (Reason A);
- 2. Sc5a Details of materials for external walls and roofs (RC To ensure the satisfactory appearance of the development);
- 3. Sc51 Landscaping (RC51);
- 4. Sc52 Implementation of landscaping (RC52);
- 5. Sc60 Details of boundary treatments (RC60);
- 6. Sc5f Details of materials to be used for hard surfaced areas within the site including the driveway and car parking areas (Reason To ensure the

satisfactory appearance of the development and to minimise disturbance to adjoining residents);

- 7. The round window shown upon drawing no. PP05 Rev.B in the east elevation of the dwelling hereby permitted shall be fixed/non-opening and permanently fitted with obscured glass (RC To protect the amenity of the occupiers of No.17 Cabbage Moor);
- 8. The rooflights shown upon drawing no. PP05 Rev.B in the south elevation of the dwelling hereby permitted shall be a minimum of 1.8 metres above the first floor finished floor level (RC To protect the amenity of the occupiers of Nos.11, 13 and 17 Cabbage Moor);
- No further windows or openings of any kind shall be inserted at first floor level in the east, south and/or west elevations of the development, hereby permitted, unless expressly authorised by planning permission granted by the Local Planning Authority in that behalf (RC22);
- 10. Sc26 (0800, 0800, 1800, 1300) Times during the construction period when power operated machinery shall not be used other than in accordance with agreed noise restrictions (RC26).

Reasons for Approval

- 1. The development is considered generally to accord with the Development Plan and particularly the following policies:
 - Cambridgeshire and Peterborough Structure Plan 2003: P1/3 (Sustainable design in built development)
 - **South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004:** SE2 (Development in Rural Growth Settlements) and HG10 (Housing Mix and Design).
- 2. The development is not considered to be significantly detrimental to the following material planning considerations which have been raised during the consultation exercise:
 - Design and scale of the development
 - Amenity of neighbours
 - Highway safety
 - Loss of planting
 - Drainage

Informatives

Should driven pile foundations be proposed, before development commences, a statement of the method for construction of these foundations should be submitted to and agreed by the District Council's Environmental Health Officer so that noise and vibration can be controlled.

During demolition and construction, there shall be no bonfires or burning of waste on site except with the prior permission of the District Council's Environmental Health Officer in accordance with best practice and existing waste management legislation.

Background Papers: the following background papers were used in the preparation of this report:

South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004

Cambridgeshire and Peterborough Structure Plan 2003
Planning file Refs: S/0897/05/F, S/2318/04/F, S/1877/03/O, S/1619/00/O, S/1589/96/O and S/1785/91/F.

Andrew Moffat - Area Planning Officer **Contact Officer:**

Telephone: (01954) 713169